



Mayor

Dee Margo

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Alexandra Annello

District 3

Cassandra H. Brown

District 4

Sam Morgan

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz
Perez

District 7

Henry Rivera

District 8

Cissy Lizarraga

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS
CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET
OCTOBER 9, 2017, 4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, October 9, 2017, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman Daniel Carey-Whalen
Commissioner Vicki Hamilton
Commissioner Sherry Knapp Mowles
Commissioner Charles Stapler
Commissioner Kelly Blough
Commissioner Don Luciano
Commissioner Geoffrey Wright

The following commissioner was not present:

Vice-Chairman D.J. Sevigny
Commissioner Samuel Trimble

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development
Mr. Omar DeLaRosa, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Carey-Whalen called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

CALL TO THE PUBLIC

Chairman Carey-Whalen asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. *There was no response.*



1. PHAP17-00028	121 Government Hill 25 & 26 (6700 Sq. Ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	4700 Chesterfield Ave
Historic District:	Austin Terrace
Property Owner:	Jose Cabada
Representative:	Tony Avila
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1925
Historic Status:	Non-Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a six foot high masonry wall at the front and side property lines
Application Filed:	9/25/17
45 Day Expiration:	11/9/17

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property is located on a corner lot. The property owner is requesting the construction of a new six foot high masonry wall at the front and side property lines. The original masonry wall was removed by a contractor June, 2017.



Chesterfield.pptx

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Construction of new fences, stairs, or sidewalk rails and replacement of older existing fences is allowed on historic properties provided that the proposed site feature is of a compatible material and scale.*
- *Rock, brick, wood and wrought iron are acceptable materials but each case is decided individually. Cinder blocks and chain link fencing are relatively recent developments and are therefore not appropriate fencing materials.*



- *The height of the proposed fence should complement the structure (primarily as viewed from the street) and should not obstruct the public's view of the building.*
- *Solid walls are appropriate for the side property lines while an open fencing material is more appropriate for the front portion of the property.*
- *Retain fences and walls that contribute to the historic character of the property and the district where possible. If replacement is necessary, replace only the deteriorated element to match the original in dimension, proportion, material, texture, and detail.*
- *Introduce new fences and walls compatible in material, design, scale, location, and size with original fences and walls in the historic district.*
- *The height of the proposed fence should complement the structure and should not obstruct the public's view of the building. Any proposed fence higher than 32" solid or 48" open, measured from ground level, at front property line or a side yard property line on a corner lot, shall be reviewed by the HLC. Any proposed fence higher than 6 ft., between buildings on an interior property line or across the rear property line, shall be reviewed by the HLC.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alterations of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*
- *Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.*

THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE NEW WALL COMPLY WITH THE GUIDELINES AND BE NO HIGHER THAN 48" TOTAL, THAT THE UPPER PORTION BE MADE OF METAL PICKETS, AND THAT THE LOWER, SOLID PORTION BE NO HIGHER THAN 32."

Marco Avila, contractor, explained the property owners liked the privacy the original masonry wall provided which is why they are requesting the construction of the six foot high masonry wall without the picket fencing.

Discussion amongst Ms. Velázquez, Chairman Carey-Whalen and Commissioners Wright, Hamilton, and Luciano and Mr. Avila.



MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Wright, seconded by Commissioner Luciano **TO APPROVE A WALL SIMILAR TO WHAT WE'RE LOOKING AT NOW.**
(per the presentation slide)

Mr. DeLaRosa requested commissioners clarify the motion language.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Wright, seconded by Commissioner Luciano **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE PROVIDED THE NEW WALL BE NO HIGHER THAN 48" TOTAL, THAT THE UPPER PORTION BE MADE OF METAL PICKETS, AND THAT THE LOWER, SOLID PORTION BE NO HIGHER THAN 32."**

2. PHAP17-00029	10 Manhattan Heights 20 & 21 (6000 Sq. Ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	3040 Aurora Ave
Historic District:	Manhattan Heights
Property Owner:	Myron Lewis
Representative:	Iceland Refrigeration
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1924
Historic Status:	Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a rooftop air conditioning unit after-the-fact
Application Filed:	9/25/17
45 Day Expiration:	11/9/17

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated this property is located on the corner, so much of the structure's features are visible. She explained the existing air conditioner, installed without proper permits, can be seen from different angles. She is recommending approval with the modification that the unit be relocated to the side yard on the east façade where it will not be visible from the right-of-way.



Aurora.pptx

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:*

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *The installation of mechanical equipment, such as air conditioning units, television, radio antennae, satellite dishes, and solar panels often results in a visually cluttered appearance to the building's exterior.*
- *Mechanical equipment should be installed in the least-visibly obtrusive location on the building, preferably at the rear of the building.*
- *In no case should mechanical equipment be installed on a visually prominent point on a roof or where it becomes the most noticeable component of the building.*
- *If a new mechanical system is needed, install it so that it causes the least amount of alteration to the building's exterior façade, screen from public view.*
- *Locate new mechanical equipment and utilities, including heating and air-conditioning units, meters, exposed pipes, and fuel tanks, in the most inconspicuous area, usually along a building's rear façade, screen from public view.*
- *It is not appropriate to install mechanical equipment in locations that compromise character-defining roofs or on roof slopes that are prominently visible from the street.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*
- *New construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

THE MODIFICATION IS THAT THE UNIT BE RELOCATED TO THE SIDE YARD ON THE EAST FAÇADE WHERE IT WILL NOT BE VISIBLE FROM THE RIGHT-OF-WAY.



Myron Lewis, property owner, brought photographs of the current property before and after the installation of the air-conditioning unit on the roof.

Discussion amongst Ms. Velázquez, Chairman Carey-Whalen and Commissioners Wright, Blough, Hamilton, Mowles and Mr. Lewis.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Carey-Whalen, seconded by Commissioner Stapler **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED THAT ALL THE EXISTING UNIT STAY AND THAT THE UNIT BE PAINTED WHITE.**

3. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. October 9, 2017 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled at the October 23, 2017 meeting. October 23, 2017 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the November 6, 2017 meeting.

No address requests from commissioners.

HLC Staff Report

4. Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A.")



Item 4 Admin Review
Status Report 10.09.



MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Stapler, seconded by Commissioner Wright ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ACCEPT THE RECOMMENDATIONS AS IS.***

Following the vote, Chairman Carey-Whalen asked Ms. Velázquez to clarify being in and out of the historic district.

PHHR17-00199 – 1513 Sun Bowl Drive, Jesse Salom Family (owners) –
Contributing Property – A request was made for the installation of roof-mounted antennae. Property parcel is located in the historic district but the building is located outside boundary of historic district.

Ms. Velázquez explained the building structure is **not** located within the historic district boundary; however, a portion of the parcel **is** located within the historic district boundary.

Other Business – Discussion and Action

5. Discussion and Action on designating date and time for the next Chapter 20.20. work session meeting.

After discussion amongst staff and commissioners, it was decided that the next HLC work session meeting will be held Monday, October 30th, 4:00 p.m., 801 Texas Avenue, second floor, Muir Conference Room.

Commissioner Mowles stated she would not be able to attend the October 30th work session meeting or the October 23rd regular HLC meeting.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Carey-Whalen, seconded by Vice-Chairman Sevigny ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 18TH, 4:00 P.M., WORK SESSION MEETING.***



6. Discussion and action on Regular meeting minutes for September 11, 2017

Chairman Carey-Whalen asked commissioners if they had any comments or questions for the Regular meeting minutes September 11, 2017.



Item 6 09.11.2017
meeting minutes.pdf

No comments.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Wright, seconded by Commissioner Luciano ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE.***

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Stapler

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Carey-Whalen, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN AT 4:44 P.M.***